



# Chatham County, NC

## Meeting Minutes

### Board of Commissioners

---

Monday, April 15, 2019

6:00 PM

Agriculture & Conference Center

---

#### Work Session - 3:00 PM - Agriculture & Conference Center

**Present:** 5 - Chair Mike Dasher, Vice Chair Diana Hales, Commissioner Jim Crawford, Commissioner Karen Howard and Commissioner Walter Petty

#### PUBLIC INPUT SESSION

*Barbara Pugh submitted the following comments:*

*Commissioners, I appreciate your willingness to make this time available to receive input from your constituents on a very emotional issue about the monument in front of the courthouse. I thank you for making the statue safe in the face of perceived challenges and for your continuing support of the North Carolina law regarding memorials of remembrance.*

*Per the demographics given on the Chatham County website, the estimated 2017 census of the county is given as 71,472. The petition for removal of the statue represents slightly more than one percent of the population.*

*The statue is not a symbol of hate nor a celebration of war. In big letters on the statue the words "THIS MONUMENT IS THE GIFT OF THOSE WHO REVERE THE MEMORY OF THE CONFEDERATE SOLDIER." It is a memorial to boys and men who were comrades, fathers, husbands, brothers, uncles, and friends as surely as the other monuments exist today to men for their sacrifices including Union troops, World War I, II, Korea, Vietnam, and currently war in the Middle East. It stands beside the flag of the United States of America. Hopefully its presence can remind us that we should not repeat mistakes made and that war is an awful thing.*

*Currently many harsh words have been written and verbalized about and between residents here in the county. This is not right. It is hurtful to denigrate long-standing respect and friendships between neighbors sometimes built on generations of living together.*

*The statue has a home right where it stands. Look at the statue as a representation of peace. See in its shadow a community of people working together to exemplify progress made over the years to be a kinder world where diverse people live, work, play, worship, love and are respected right here. May we not tear down but build up.*

*Respectfully submitted to the Commissioners, April 15, 2019. Barbara Pugh  
Firstly a citizen of Chatham County but also President, Winnie Davis Chapter #259*

*Marie Harrison submitted the following comments:*

*Per the NC Department of Non-Public Education, as of school year 2017-2018, there were 580 registered homeschools in Chatham County, with a total of 980 students. As of last year, there were also five private schools in Chatham County with a total of 171 students. This means the total of non-public registered Chatham County students as of last year were 1,151.*

*Homeschool parents adhere to the state laws governing home education and support those laws. When our children graduate from homeschool or private high school in Chatham County, they are recognized as legal high school graduates by the State of North Carolina.*

*All of the homeschool families in Chatham County pay taxes which support local government, infrastructure and public schools. None of the homeschool families benefit in any way from the taxes which support local public schools. And none of us expect to benefit from said taxes.*

*The new Promise program with CCCC currently excludes homeschoolers and private-schoolers from receiving the financial benefits of subsidized college education at the community college level, even if the college currently has home or private-educated students enrolled in the previous program which had already recognized their college-level abilities and subsequent grades.*

*It does, however, benefit those students whose parents are quite likely not even on the Chatham County tax rolls, per the CCCC website: "Am I still eligible for the Central Carolina Promise program if I am classified as out-of-state, undocumented, or a DACA student? Yes. The Central Carolina Promise program will cover tuition and fees up to the in-state tuition rate. The student would be responsible for paying the difference in cost from in-state to out-of-state."*

*I am here to request that our homeschooled and private-schooled high school graduates be included in this new Promise program. Retaining good students in the local community college can only benefit Chatham County, as the students will live, work, spend money and hopefully settle down to reside in this county. Thank you.*

## **BOARD PRIORITIES**

### **19-3006**

**Vote on a request to consider the amended contract for Chatham Promise**

**Attachments:**     [Chatham County Promise MOU updated draft](#)

*CCCC Provost Mark Hall reviewed the requested changes to the Chatham Promise agreement.*

*Commissioner Howard asked if CCCC has any sense of the number of students that would qualify for the program. Dr. Hall said there are about 50-60 juniors and seniors enrolled in homeschool programs that would be eligible for the program.*

**A motion was made by Commissioner Petty, seconded by Commissioner Crawford, that this Contract, attached hereto and by reference made a part**

hereof, be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3021](#)

Vote on a request to review, comment, and endorse the Chatham County Triangle Area Rural Transportation Organization (TARPO) and Durham-Chapel Hill-Carrboro Metropolitan Planning Organization (DCHC MPO) draft transportation project lists to be considered for submittal to the State Prioritization Office of Transportation (SPOT) for the Prioritization 6.0 process.

**Attachments:**    [TARPO Project List](#)  
[DCHC MPO Project List](#)  
[Spot 6.0 Powerpoint](#)  
[SPOT 6.0 Viewer](#)

*Planner Chance Mullis reviewed the specifics of the request.*

**A motion was made by Vice Chair Hales, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Agenda Item be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3036](#)

Discuss directing staff to contact the local board of elections and the State board of elections and complete all requirements in order to have the Article 46 sales tax advisory referendum included on the ballot during the March 3, 2020 statewide primary.

*Budget Analyst Darrell Butts reviewed the specifics of the request. Mr. Butts stated the funds can be used for any allowable expense. The Board can pass a resolution stating the intended use. A resolution does not bind future boards.*

*Commissioner Petty stated he is in favor in putting this on the ballot but he thinks the Board should decide the intended use of the funds before it goes on the ballot. The residents need to know what they are voting for.*

**A motion was made by Vice Chair Hales, seconded by Commissioner Howard, to direct staff to move forward with next steps. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

**CLOSED SESSION**

[19-3032](#)

Closed session to discuss matters relating to personnel and attorney-client privilege.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Howard, seconded by Vice Chair Hales,**

to approve going out of the Work Session and convening in Closed Session to discuss matters relating to personnel and attorney-client privilege. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

## **ADJOURNMENT**

A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this meeting be adjourned. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

## **End of Work Session**

### **Regular Session - 6:00 PM - Agriculture & Conference Center**

**Present:** 5 - Chair Mike Dasher, Vice Chair Diana Hales, Commissioner Jim Crawford, Commissioner Karen Howard and Commissioner Walter Petty

## **INVOCATION and PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

*Chairman Dasher invited everyone to pause for a moment of silence and reflection after which he invited everyone present to stand and recite the Pledge of Allegiance.*

## **CALL TO ORDER**

*Commissioner Petty asked the Board if he could read a prepared statement:*

*Thank you for allowing me this time. As the meeting progresses, people normally leave once the agenda item they are interested in is handled. I wanted to cover this before everyone dispersed.*

*I've spent much of the past year evaluating priorities and some of the accomplishments of the board during my time serving on it. The truth is I never thought I would serve more than one term yet here I am nine years later on term three.*

*Over these past nine years I've done my best to stay away from party politics or political agendas. I've tried to stay away from issues that aren't truly beneficial to the wellbeing of CHATHAM county and to serve all citizens based on the facts as I understood them.*

*I've focused on looking after tax payers' dollars as if they were my own. I prioritized and invested in those areas that fall within the core functions of our county government. In the first few years of my term you saw an increase in budget without any tax rate increases. You saw an increase in funding for our schools and public safety again, all while seeing a prolonged period of ZERO tax increase. I worked closely with the school superintendent to structure the first of its kind bonus program for our teachers.*

*I'm honored to have been a part of a team making Chatham welcoming to everybody, increasing the commercial tax base and creating more job opportunities. These kinds*

*of things were fun for me because I enjoy serving others.*

*But: I'm reminded of Ecclesiastes' "to everything there is a season and a time to every purpose."*

*For me, that season is over and the purpose has changed.*

*Tonight, I'm announcing my resignation from the board effective at the end of this month. As many of you know I missed the last BOC meeting. I have missed several other associated events as well as a couple other BOC meetings. The demands of my schedule have become increasingly more difficult to manage.*

*To this wonderful staff: I appreciate the professionalism and dedication all of you have to serving others. You have made this job an absolute pleasure and much easier than I expected for someone like myself outside government services.*

*I have learned a lot and I appreciate the opportunity to serve. I have done my best and resign with no regrets.*

*As far as what the future holds,*

*The Lord has blessed me with a wonderful staff at work, they kept the business going in my absence. It is now time to get more engaged and focus my energy on it. I have gotten more involved in research and development of the ag industry and plan to continue that more aggressively because of its importance to feeding the world.*

*I enjoy serving others and will continue in some capacity but my calling is somewhere else now.*

*I'm confident someone will step forward to complete my term who will be committed to working on behalf of the citizens of Chatham.*

*In the meantime, the current board majority is like minded for the most part so decisions will come to the same conclusion without my vote.*

*To all those who have trusted me with this responsibility I want to say thank you. It has been an honor.*

*Oh, and one last thing. Please stay on the land issue needed to get that hospital sign put up at the business park. When I came on this board, I never figured this issue would be so difficult to resolve.*

*Each member of the Board thanked Commissioner Petty for his service and said it has been an honor to serve with him.*

## **APPROVAL OF AGENDA and CONSENT AGENDA**

*The Clerk stated approval of the County Manager's contract needed to be added to the Consent Agenda.*

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that the Agenda and Consent Agenda be approved as amended. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3031](#)

Vote on a request to approve the March 18, 2019 Work and Regular Session Minutes.

**Attachments:**     [Draft Minutes 03.18.2019](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that the Minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-2955](#)

Vote on a Legislative request for approval for general use rezoning from CU-Ind Heavy to R-1 Residential by Jim Saputo on property located at 148 Rush Rd. New Hill, Parcel No. 5545, being approx. 51.6 acres.

**Attachments:**     [More information from the Planning Department website](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that Resolution #2019-18 Adopting a Consistency State for the Approval of Rezoning for Jim Saputo, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Ordinance Amending the Zoning Map of Chatham County for Jim Saputo, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be adopted. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3022](#)

Recommendation from Unified Development Ordinance Selection Committee to award the Unified Development Ordinance contract to CodeWright. Request for an approval of contract award and authorize the County Manager to execute all contracts and change orders associated with the project as well as reflect changes to budget in accordance to negotiated price.

**Attachments:**     [Evaluation Matrix](#)  
                              [CodeWright UDO Interview Handout 3-25-19 - F](#)  
                              [Chatham County UDO RFP Response negotiated price 4 1 19](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Agenda Item be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3020](#)

Vote on a request to approve by F-L Legacy Owner, LLC for subdivision Preliminary Plat approval of **The Legacy at Jordan Lake - Phases 4A3, 6A1, and 6A2** consisting of 88 lots (34 lots in 4A3, 27 lots in 6A1 and 27 lots in 6A2) on 30.90 acres, located off SR-1716, Big Woods Road, parcels #17378 and 92463.

**Attachments:**      [More information from the Planning Department website](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Agenda Item be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-2958](#)

Vote on a Legislative request for approval to amend Sections 1-4, Definitions and Terms; 2-4 (4), Setbacks; and 2-4 (6), Height, of the Wireless Telecommunication Facilities Ordinance to provide a telecommunication tower height waiver for public safety service providers.

**Attachments:**      [More information from the Planning Department website](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Ordinance Amending the Wireless Telecommunication Facilities Ordinance, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3026](#)

Vote on a Request to Approve Amendment #FY19-1960-1 for contract #FY19-1960 between Chatham County Department of Social Services and Sister 2 Sister Solutions.

**Attachments:**      [Sister 2 Sister Solutions Contract Amendment](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Contract, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3012](#)

Vote on a request to adopt a Resolution Proclaiming April 2019 as Child Abuse Prevention Month.

**Attachments:**      [2019 Resolution - Proclaim April 2019 Child Abuse Prevention Month](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Resolution #2019-19 Proclaiming April 2019 Child Abuse Prevention Month, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof be adopted. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3029](#)

Vote on a request to adopt a Resolution Supporting Juvenile Crime Prevention Council Allocation Expansion

**Attachments:** [boc resolution supporting juvenile crime prevention council](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that Resolution #2019-20 Supporting Juvenile Crime Prevention Council Allocation Expansion, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be adopted. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3016](#)

Vote on a request to adopt a Resolution Declaring Property Surplus and Authorizing the Finance Officer to sell the property on GovDeals.

**Attachments:** [Surplus Sale Resolution](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that Resolution #2019-21 Declaring Property Surplus and Authorizing the Finance Officer to Sell the Property, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be adopted. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3024](#)

Vote on a request to adopt a Resolution declaring an Intent to Reimburse on the New School Central Services Building, Emergency Operations Center Expansion, and an Emergency Communications Radio System Upgrade

**Attachments:** [Resolution of the County of Chatham Intent to Reimburse](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that Resolution #2019-22, Declaring Intent to Reimburse on the New School Central Services Building, Emergency Operations Center Expansion, and an Emergency Communications Radio System Upgrade, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be adopted. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3028](#)

Vote on a request to adopt a Resolution Proclaiming May 2019 as Older Americans Month.

**Attachments:** [2019OlderAmericansMonth](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that Resolution #2019-23, Proclaiming May 2019 as Older Americans Month, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be adopted. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3037](#)

Vote on a request to adopt a Resolution Proclaiming April 18, 2019 as Electric Utility Linemen Appreciation Day

**Attachments:** [lineman proclamation april 2019](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that Resolution #2019-24, Proclaiming April 18, 2019 as Electric Utility Linemen Appreciation Day, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be adopted. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-2996](#)

Vote on a request to accept \$2,000.00 Association of Foods and Drug Officials (AFDO) Grant Funds.

**Attachments:** [\\$2,000.00 AFDO Grant Funds](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Agenda Item be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3013](#)

Vote on a request to approve \$10,000 Chatham Hospital Community Health Assessment Work Funds

**Attachments:** [\\$10,000 Chatham Hospital Community Health Assessment Funds](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Agenda Item be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3023](#)

Vote on a request to accept \$20,977 from NCDHHS Food Protection and Facilities Branch

**Attachments:** [\\$20,977 Food & Lodging t Funds](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Agenda Item be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3017](#)

Vote on a request to approve the naming of two private roads in Chatham County

**Attachments:**     [MCSHIRE LANE PETITION](#)  
[MCSHIRE LANE MAP](#)  
[BIRCHTREE CIRCLE PETITION](#)  
[BIRCHTREE CIRCLE MAP](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Agenda Item be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3025](#)

Vote on a request to approve a contract for paving at the Goldston, Harpers Crossroads and Bennett solid waste collection centers and authorize the County Manager to execute the contract

**Attachments:**     [Collection Center Paving 2019 Contract contractor signed](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Contract, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[18-2872](#)

Vote on a request to approve Tax Department - Charging off Tax Bills

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Agenda Item be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3027](#)

Vote on a request to approve Tax Releases and Refunds

**Attachments:**     [March 2019 Release and Refund Report](#)  
[March 2019 NCVTS Pending Refund Report](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Agenda Item, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3039](#)

Vote on a request to send a letter congratulating Pittsboro Presbyterian Church on becoming a PC(USA) Earth Care Congregation

**Attachments:**     [FINAL congrats to pittsboro presbyterian earth care april 2019](#)

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Agenda Item be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

[19-3090](#)

Vote on a request to approve the County Manager's employment contract.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Crawford, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Contract, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

### **End of Consent Agenda**

### **SPECIAL PRESENTATION**

[19-3034](#)

Receive presentation from the Hispanic Liaison's Youth Leadership Latinx Program

**Attachments:** [OLP Commissioners Presentation](#)

*Selina Lopez, Youth Leadership Program Manager for the Hispanic Liaison, and the youth from the Hispanic Liaison gave a presentation to the Board. (Presentation attached)*

*Commissioner Howard told the youth they are heard and valued.*

### **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

[19-3018](#)

A legislative public hearing request by Chatham County ABC Board to rezone parcel 83475, being approximately .80 acres, located off Moncure Pittsboro Rd, from R-5 Residential to General Use Neighborhood Business, Haw River Township.

**Attachments:** [More information from the Planning Department website](#)

*Zoning Administrator Angela Birchett reviewed the specifics of the request.*

*Attorney for the applicant, Patrick Bradshaw, made a brief statement about the request.*

*The Chair opened the hearing.*

*Patti Dukes submitted the following comments:*

*Thank you for giving me the opportunity to represent some of the Three Rivers District folks. We are representing our neighboring landowner Barry Gaines. This is not the best use of the land right at his property. Additionally, to come off the exit ramp in Moncure and be faced with a liquor store when usually you would turn right to go to the*

*Jordan Dam or to the school. We don't feel this is a very good representation of who we are. There is a school bus stop right there at the entrance to that parcel. We encourage you to oppose the rezoning of this parcel.*

*The Chair closed the hearing.*

**This Agenda Item was referred to the Planning Board.**

[19-3019](#)

A quasi-judicial public hearing request by Antoinette L. Van-Riel for a conditional use permit revision on parcel 19430, being approximately 3 acres, located at 781 Mt. Carmel Church Rd, to add the use of office - business, professional, and governmental, Williams Township.

**Attachments:**     [More information from the Planning Department website](#)

*The Chair administered the oath to those wishing to speak.*

*Zoning Administrator Angela Birchett reviewed the specifics of the request.*

*Ms. Birchett: This is a quasi-judicial public hearing by Antoinette Van-Riel for a conditional permit revision of parcel 19430 being approximately three acres, located at 781 Mt. Carmel Church Road, to add the use of office, business professional, and governmental to the already existing business. As you can see from the zoning map this property already has a conditional use B1 zoning classification and it has done so for about two decades now. It has been a yoga/pilates studio, a coffee shop, a waterscapes and yard decor business. It has changed ownership once again and they don't want to utilize the uses that have already been approved because under the conditional use permit it is only approved for the things they ask for. It is not a blanket approval. In order to add another use they have to go back through the revision process, which is what is happening here, to add the office use to the property. They are not changing anything about the outside appearance. They are not adding on. They are not changing the level of people that would be allowed on the current systems out there. It is just to add the use. We have not heard anything from any adjoining property owners from any of the advertisements or anything of that nature. We have reviewed the past files. There are no current violations nor have there been any violations on this property since they have had their approval, for about twenty years. They have always complied with the zoning land use regulations. I don't know if applicants are here. Is anyone here for 781? (A gentleman in the audience raised his hand) Did you get sworn in a while ago?*

*Chair Dasher: If you want to speak I can go ahead and swear you in. (Chair Dasher administered the oath)*

*Ronnie Cardwell: My name is Ronnie Cardwell. We own home health care agencies. We actually acquired a property that has been in operation in Chatham County since 1993. One of the things we like to do as business owners is invest back into the area which we are growing in. For us, this is a property that allows us to become owners of and also to run our existing company that is already in operation in Chatham County.*

*Vice Chair Hales: So you are planning to use this as office space?*

*Mr. Cardwell: Yes.*

*Chair Dasher: Any other questions or comments?*

*George Lucier: So you are moving your existing business from a different location in Chatham County to this proposed location that you are asking for the change for the conditional use permit, is that correct?*

*Mr. Cardwell: Yes sir.*

*Mr. Lucier: Thank you.*

*Chair Dasher: Thank you. Thank you Ms. Birchett.*

**This Agenda Item was referred to the Planning Board.**

## **BOARD PRIORITIES**

### **19-3035**

Vote on a request to adopt a Resolution In Favor of Expanding North Carolina Medicaid Coverage.

**Attachments:**     [Medicaid Resolution](#)

*Commissioner Crawford read the resolution into the record.*

*Commissioner Crawford stated the Board passed a similar resolution back in 2015. The situation hasn't changed. North Carolinians are paying into the Medicare program now, so this is money that we are already paying in. Because our state isn't participating in the expansion, that money is going to other states. He believes it makes moral sense to help those that are most vulnerable and it makes economic sense to use the money we are paying into the system to benefit our own people.*

*Commissioner Petty stated he is fully aware of the undue burden placed on them because of those who are uninsured. Those that are insured are paying for those that are uninsured. He does agree that everyone should have affordable health care coverage but he would love to find another way to do that instead of expanding something we have some problems with. He doesn't know if another way has even been discovered or offered yet. Because we don't have a better way right now he will support the resolution.*

*Commissioner Howard understands Medicaid is not perfect but we can't let people fall between the cracks in the interim.*

**A motion was made by Vice Chair Hales, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that Resolution #2019-25 in Favor of Expanding North Carolina Medicaid Coverage, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be adopted. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

### **19-3033**

Presentation by Chatham For All: Following a year and a half of individual comment, information and requests, Chatham For All, a group of Chatham residents, will talk about the Confederate monument in front of the Courthouse and request that the Commissioners return it to its owner, the United Daughters of the Confederacy.

**Attachments:**     [Chair Dasher Monument Remarks](#)  
[Chatham For All Request and Supporting Information](#)  
[Chatham For All Letter to BOC 4.15.19](#)  
[Howard Fifer Remarks 4.15.19](#)  
[Carl Thompson Remarks 4.15.19](#)  
[Chris Kaman Remarks 4.15.19](#)  
[Emily Moose Remarks 4.15.19](#)  
[Commissioners Meeting Statue Presentation 4.15.19](#)

*Chair Dasher read a statement to those in attendance. (Statement attached)*

*Howard Fifer introduced the group Chatham for All. Mr. Fifer, Chris Kayman, Carl Thompson and Emily Moose all read statements to the Board. (Statements attached)*

## **PUBLIC INPUT SESSION**

*James Dennis Brooks submitted the following comments:*

*For many years I have endeavored to educate those who sought insight on the period of time that includes the years 1861 to 1865. In my effort to do this, I have spent many hours researching the available information pertaining to various topics.*

*Those included would be religious, social, economic, political, and martial. I suppose that the area of martial or military would be my favorite and thus the one with which I dwell upon more than the other subjects.*

*As a participant in re-creating military life during this period of time much attention has been given to afford the most accurate portrayal possible. So much so, that participants are now referred to as "living historians" instead of re-enactors. The vast majority of the participants can and will represent either "side" of this conflict, myself included. We "live" the life when we attempt to portray a soldier during that period of time.*

*What has this to do with the subject at hand this evening you might ask? The extensive research and study that has been and is required to get into "character" has brought those men to life for me. They were soldiers, all far from home and family, both those in the Blue and the Gray. The greatest fear they possessed was not death, but to be forgotten in death. While I did not serve this country in the military, I can tell you research proves out that in actual combat the sacrifices made are to preserve one another first and foremost. This esprit de corps was the driving force that led to the many monuments and memorials that were created both north and south in remembrance of those who served their respective state, and to fulfill wishes of those who did not survive the conflict that they would never be forgotten.*

*Many times I have been questioned as to my thoughts for this country had the south prevailed in their attempt of independence. My response has always been this- most likely western expansion would have never occurred due to the likelihood European countries would have reclaimed this continent.*

*Fortunately the same individuals, who attempted to deal death upon each other, now with the same zeal; chose to support each other in forging a new nation that afforded its citizens opportunities unlike anywhere else on this earth. Every player had a part in this and it is our collective duty to remember them. I suggest that the effort to move this monument is simply a step to erase from memory a portion of our history. What*

would be next?

*Commissioners, I am most certain that there are others here tonight who share my concerns. If you would indulge me I would ask that they be allowed to stand. Thank you.*

*Brantley Webster is in support of the statue staying in its current location.*

*Vicki Atkinson submitted the following comments:*

*My name is Vickie Atkinson. I live at 361 Wild Ginger Ridge in Chatham County. I was born in North Carolina and have always lived in this state. I have ancestors who fought for the Confederacy. I believe the statue in front of the courthouse should be removed.*

*This monument and others were put up during Jim Crow era. They were part of a plan to hold on to white supremacy. The history I learned about the Civil War growing up in North Carolina was limited and misleading. What I heard in my elementary and high school classes was that the North invaded the South in the "War Between the States," I heard about the "the lost cause," and about state's rights. But I have since learned the truth: the Civil War was primarily about slavery and the economics of slavery. The cause of the Confederacy was wrong. The monuments honor the wrong side of history. Slavery was an abomination that continues to haunt us. A statue to white supremacy should not stand in front of the courthouse.*

*No, we cannot change history. But we can tell the full story. As President George W. Bush said at the -- at the dedication ceremony for the National Museum of African American History and Culture "A great nation does not hide its history. It faces its flaws and" it "corrects them." There are many more flaws that we need to correct for in our treatment of African Americans: in our criminal justice system, housing, education and other areas. But we have the opportunity to correct this one flaw in our county relatively quickly. We can change what we honor about our past. We can remove the stature. I hope we will do so.*

*Nancy Jacobs submitted the following comments:*

*I know that some people say and believe that the monument that stands outside of the Pittsboro Courthouse is in honor of their ancestors who fought to defend their homes. That may be their true and honest feelings. However that is not the real reason this statue was erected. We cannot forget those ancestors, including some of mine, were fighting for the right for the South to keep people in bondage against their will, a brutal, violent and immoral act of inhumanity.*

*The Civil War was a war fought by the majority poor for the benefit of a few wealthy white landowners. It was about money and property.... People considered as property, and a way of life that could not be maintained without their free, forced labor. There can be no excuse for that. And there is no getting around that by saying it has nothing to do with race.*

*This statue was put up during the Jim Crow era, when white people were bent on keeping the romantic, reconfigured idea of the "Old South" alive, making sure that people of color knew who was in charge, and reminding them every time passed*

*through town with the image of this soldier.*

*There are hundreds of statues in NC, thousands of these statues across the south. Let's put them where they belong, in a museum, on private property, or in a Confederate Cemetery where people can see them if they want to, and not have all of the population see them daily and be reminded of the shameful past of U.S. history every time we pass.*

*Leda Hartman submitted the following comments:*

*I would like to address the idea that the statue is about history and heritage. If that's so, here's a piece of history we should consider: Not all white Southerners supported the Confederacy. Not by a long shot. A good number of Southern army officers chose to fight by the side of the Union - including two of Robert E. Lee's cousin and one of his nephews.*

*Then, right here in the North Carolina piedmont, we had the Red Strings. They were a secret underground group that did everything they could to sabotage the Confederacy - spying, helping soldiers desert, destroying supply lines. At their height, the Red Strings had 10,000 member across the state and beyond.*

*The nation's very first draft was instituted by the Confederacy. Apparently the Confederate Army couldn't raise enough volunteers. You wonder what ordinary conscripts would say about the rich man's war and the poor man's fight. Especially because men who owned 20 slaves or more were exempt from that fight. Some conscripts spoke with their feet. North Carolina had an unusually high rate of desertion - perhaps as high as 25 percent. In fact, there were so many deserters in Chatham County that in March of 1862 the Army had to send a company of soldiers her to round them up.*

*The end of the war didn't end the division either, especially when it came to monuments. Robert E. Lee spoke out against them. He believed they would just pour salt on the nation's wounds and keep us from healing.*

*Here's what he wrote in 1869 about a proposed monument in Gettysburg: "I think it wiser not to keep open the sores of war but to follow the examples of those nations endeavored to obliterate the marks of civil strife, to commit to oblivion the feelings engendered."*

*Then there's the famous story of the time Lee went to visit a lady near Lexington, Virginia. She showed him a tree in her yard that was a casualty of the war. All its limbs had been shot off and its trunk had been ruined by cannonballs. Lee said: "Cut it down, my dear madam, and forget it." Given this history, it looks like the Daughters of the Confederacy, in erecting their monuments, were actually disrespecting Lee's wishes. Not to mention denying some uncomfortable truths about the South's Civil War heritage.*

*And in Pittsboro's case, Lee's fears proved true. In 1907 shortly after the courthouse statue was unveiled, someone defaced it with black shoe polish and grease. Yes, the statue is a memorial to fallen Confederate soldiers. But it is also without a doubt, a symbol of division - and not just division between black and white, or North and South. Which is why it never belonged on public land in the first place.*

*And here we are, 112 years later, still divided. Isn't it time to let this soldier stack arms, stand down, and rest in peace?*

*Nikolai Mather supports removing the confederate monument.*

*Carolyn Stern submitted the following comments:*

*No one is being victimized by that statue (gravestone for thousands of soldiers that never received a burial) and anyone who says they are is creating a false narrative to advance their own agenda. That is a despicable sin; one equal to the sins of Confederate politicians whose sin was told on the backs of Confederate soldiers. Can you erase history? Being wrong about slavery doesn't excuse our burden to understand why the Confederate Soldier was motivated to fight. The destruction of physical or intangible artifacts that embody the ideas, beliefs and characteristics of past societies is a well tested means of control and power. That's what's going on here and it's a punk move. Anyone in favor of it should be ashamed of themselves. The Confederacy won the battle of historical memory. It's been 150 years. The statue itself cannot teach future generations about slavery, but it demonstrates the relevance of honor. Have you ever been to a country where statues were torn down? How is it that you have the power to do that? Votes from minorities can't be so essential that you're putting yourselves in a place of divinity. Erect a monument of George Moses Horton and take credit for it, but don't try to erase history. Don't give in. Or have you already?*

*Jean Chapman supports removing the Confederate statue.*

*Bruce Davis submitted the following comments:*

*My name is Bruce Eugene Davis. I am a citizen of Chatham County. I am a descendant of several civil war confederate veterans.*

*Some of the North Carolina family names of my Civil War era ancestors are: The Coreys and Tuckers of Winterville and Greenville, the Taylors of Pleasant Plains in Ashe County, and Sidney Clay Anderson, 1846 to 1936, who was born near Madison in Rockingham County, and also lived in Durham and Greensboro. He is my great grandfather, one of my confederate veteran ancestors, and lived next door to my mother until his death when she was 17. Thus, he was a part of my life as shared with me by my mother.*

*While it is important to know and understand our histories, it is more important to make informed decisions about who we honor and for what contributions we honor them.*

*My genealogy could have led me to be a supporter of the confederate soldier monument that stands in the circle in Pittsboro in front of our historic Chatham County Courthouse. But it does not...*

*As an American Citizen I do not support the idea of ownership as property of one human being by another. I do not support the idea of attempted secession of our state from the United States of America. I do not support the ideas and actions, 40 years after the end of the Civil War, to reframe those mistakes with the placement all across*

*the south of Monuments like ours here in Pittsboro. These Monuments were part of a rewriting of history and a resurgence of institutional racial inequality.*

*As an informed Citizen of Chatham County, I believe that our Courthouse Monument to that resurgence should be removed from public property and respectfully returned to its owners, the Daughters of the Confederacy, in a civil and methodical manner.*

*We have an opportunity here to set a good example for our children. We have an opportunity here to act in accordance with the best principles embedded in our North Carolina and United States Constitutions.*

*Bob Pearson submitted the following comments:*

*Commissioners, you have before you a moral decision as well as a legal one. You will be judged on how well the decision promotes equality and justice for all of Chatham County's citizens.*

*My name is Bob Pearson. My family goes back nearly 300 years in the South and ancestors fought in the Revolution - and in the Civil War. I am a resident of Chatham County and the Education Chair of the East Chatham County NAACP.*

*I understand the value that many people place on the Confederate statue. A war in which white southerners believed ended in utter defeat and the deaths of hundreds of thousands of their sons, husbands, fathers and brothers.*

*Had that cause prevailed, however, four million black Americans would have been enslaved - forever. The Confederate Constitution made this a requirement. Instead the four million became free citizens, with the right to vote and to enjoy the equal protection of the law - like every other American.*

*Those American constitutional rights were destroyed when the southern leadership came home to reimpose an order as close to slavery as possible. Chief among its weapons was lynching - murder by mob - even celebrated and photographed by the mob - to terrorize black Americans and force them to give up their rights.*

*In NC, with one exception, there were only three counties with as many as six lynchings. Chatham County is one of those three. Four people were lynched in a single day.*

*Those six lynchings and the political order that promoted them are as much a part of the history of Chatham County as is a statue honoring Confederate veterans. These six victims too should be properly remembered.*

*Let us use this moment for reconciliation - to share all the history of Chatham County and build a new narrative. Your commitment that the decisions you make will advance the cause of equality and justice for every citizen of Chatham County is the only goal you can morally pursue.*

*Gene Brooks supports leaving the statue in its current location.*

*Vickie Shea submitted the following comments:*

*Thank you for giving all of us this opportunity to express our opinions. I think that all the opinions you will hear I have heard tonight are equally valuable and valid. And clearly all opinions are deeply and passionately felt.*

*I think that for most of us, our passion is not really about the Civil War. That time period is very removed from daily lives. We know about it and think about it based on history books or stories handed down in families over many generations, but I don't really think we have a passion to re-fight the Civil War. We are all part of the United States now - we are all Americans.*

*For some of us here tonight, our passions are in the present - our national and local politics are highly polarized and we disagree about many issues.*

*But I think the county should give the statue back to its owners not because of our present politics, but because of the circumstances in a different time: 1907.*

*The time when the statue was placed in its current location was the period of Jim Crow, when white people were using both legal- at the time - and illegal means to make sure that black people, even if they were no longer slaves, did not have equal rights.*

*And the place it was put up - County property - in fact the county courthouse - served to demonstrate to black people that white people controlled this county, its government, and its justice system.*

*I believe that most people in Chatham County have moved beyond that way of thinking and acting. But that statue is frozen in a terrible time and place. I don't think it should loom any longer over our government or our justice system. I think it's time to give it back to the private group that owns it, the Daughters of the Confederacy, so they can place it on private property and honor it as they wish. Give it back.*

*Jan Nichols, Chair of the Chatham County Democratic Party presented the following resolution:*

**A RESOLUTION CALLING FOR THE CHATHAM COUNTY COMMISSIONERS TO RETURN THE CONFEDERATE MONUMENT IN FRONT OF THE HISTORIC COURTHOUSE IN PITTSBORO TO ITS OWNERS**

*WHEREAS, The confederate statue in front of the historic courthouse in Pittsboro was purchased by and is owned by the Winnie Davis Chapter of the United Daughters of the Confederacy (UDC); and*

*WHEREAS, In 1907, pursuant to a written license granted by the Chatham County Commissioners to that group, the monument was removed from their private property and was permitted to be placed where presently located; and*

*WHEREAS, When granted such license, the local chapter of the UDC was required to "cut down the tree in front of the courthouse near to the place proposed for said monument; and the said monument may remain in the care and keeping of the said daughters of the Confederacy"; and WHEREAS, The North Carolina State law that*

*purports to limit the movement or removal of "objects of remembrance" has certain exceptions setting forth circumstances to which the law does not apply; and*

*WHEREAS, The circumstances here in Chatham County are squarely within one such exception to the law, as follows: "An object of remembrance owned by a private party and that is the subject of a legal agreement between the private party and the State or a political subdivision of the state governing the removal or relocation of that property"; and*

*WHEREAS, The presence of the monument on public property forces our county government and all taxpayers in Chatham County to endorse the values of the UDC embodied by said monument; and*

*WHEREAS, Individual citizens have a First Amendment right to keep monuments on their private property, but our government, which is supposed to serve all citizens, should not endorse a symbol that represents the oppression of a group of its citizens; now, therefore be it*

*RESOLVED, That the Chatham County Democratic Party support a request to be presented to the Chatham County Commissioners to take measures necessary to return the monument in front of the Historic Courthouse in Pittsboro to its owner, the UDC.*

*Adopted by the Chatham County Democratic Party  
March 30, 2019, Pittsboro, NC*

*Cheri DeRosia supports the Board returning the monument to the UDC.*

*Keith Roberts submitted the following comments:*

*Tonight you heard from a group, Chatham for All as they try to convince you that our statue and all other statues were really about intimidation and white supremacy. I want you to know that there were a lot of monuments put up in North Carolina during the same time period as our beloved Heroes monument, and not all of them were to the Confederate dead. There were several monuments dedicated to Union troops. The New Jersey monument in New Bern erected in 1908, where the United Daughters of the Confederacy hosted a reception for the Union Veterans families. It was said that "the speeches reflected the sentiment that differences were no longer important, but rather the heroism and courage of American soldiers on both sides fighting for what they believed. There is the Massachusetts Monument in New Bern that was dedicated in 1908 and the Maine Monument in Salisbury dedicated in 1876. There is the Colored Union Soldiers Monument dedicated in 1910 in Hertford County. There were many dedications made during these years.*

*The United Daughters of the Confederacy donated time to many causes. There was a World War I plaque that was in our courthouse when it burned in 2010. Did you know that the United Daughters of the Confederacy, Winnie Davis Chapter were the presenters of this 5 foot tall plaque? Do you think their motive was to promote white supremacy or honor the dead of this county who gave their lives to defend it?*

*Chatham for All is a misleading name because it doesn't represent all and no one group ever will. That is why we have different opinions, especially when it comes to who*

*we honor and how we choose to honor them. Their group will not be happy if our monument is removed. The statue is just low hanging fruit. They will not be happy until every monument, every street, everything that has a hint of Southern in it is eradicated. There are forces out there right now demanding the removal of Thomas Jefferson and George Washington statues. The mayor of Winston-Salem wants to remove the word Dixie from the Dixie Classic. WWI and WWII memorials have already been defaced. Groups have already started attacking the churches and religious symbols. Nothing is safe. Not even the 911 memorial on HWY 501, because the custodian is private just like the United Daughters of the Confederacy. Will that become offensive to someone and have to be removed as well?*

*The South was under military occupation from 1865 until 1877. We were left with nothing, and many homes were burned to the ground. Maybe that was a reason it took 30 some years to scrape up enough money to honor the fallen. A quote from John Daniel Davidson "Tearing down Confederate statues, or any monuments from our history, will not change the past, But it will make for a poorer, less enlightened future."*

*Farrell Moose submitted the following comments:*

*My Name is Farrell Moose and I live and work here in Chatham Co.*

*I appreciate the opportunity to address y'all. Thank you for the work that you do for our county. My family is still farming in the same area of Cabarrus Co. NC where they settled in the 1700s. Members of my family fought and died in the Civil War. While I do sympathize with folks that see the Confederate memorial as solely honoring the veterans of that war, that would be better accomplished on a battlefield or cemetery.*

*The historic courthouse is our community's most prominent symbol of our commitment to each other and to equal protection under the law. To allow a Confederate monument to stand sentinel in front of it sends a very unambiguous message about these ideas. I understand somewhat the political difficulties in what I am asking you. But still I'd like to call on you to begin this process immediately. This hour in Americas history is crucial. To relocate the monument now is as much a part of history as when it was put up this statue in this location is unbearable for those of us who would see our county honor the richness of a history that includes us all, and our ability to change for the better. Thanks.*

*Monica Jarnagin submitted the following comments:*

*Mrs. H.A. London worked tirelessly to fundraise for the monument in the center of Pittsboro. Her husband wrote in 1898 of a meeting in Goldsboro that convened thousands of white men, quote, "for the sole and alt-important purpose of securing white supremacy...This meeting," he said, "was composed of white men regardless of their past party affiliation. For the object in view was not so much the success of any political party as it was to restore Anglo-Saxon supremacy and good government." He continued, "Those who attended this meeting were not there as Democrats, or as Republicans or as Populists, but as WHITE men." End quote. Just days later, \*thousands of white men\* descended on Wilmington to destroy black businesses, murder black citizens and those who support them, and reinstate alt-white control of government. Within a few years, fundraising began for the statue in this town center, with raciatized terror and oppression \*as expressed by the leaders of the community\* for context.*

*Some recognize these monuments are relics of slavery and racial intimidation, but wish to keep them in place for education and to supposedly avoid a repeat of history. This is a country where the net worth of white households is roughly 13% higher on average than black households; black infants are about 230 percent more likely than white infants to die before their first birthdays; Non-Hispanic black women experience maternal deaths at three to four times that of non-Hispanic white women, regardless of socioeconomic status; AND, although rates of drug use and sales are similar across racial and ethnic lines, Black people represent nearly 40 percent of those incarcerated in state or federal prison for drug law violations even though they represent only 13 percent of the population overall.*

*Chattel slavery has been abolished, but racial disparities and white supremacy are as current as ever. These statistics are real--the past may be the past, but \*this\* is our present, and as a collective, we white Americans have NOT learned from the past in a broad sense. Moving these statues from places of public prominence and reverence is part of a broader movement to reconcile with our past, not erase it. Our county has an opportunity to be part of that reconciliation and movement forward.*

*Thank you to the folks presenting later for doing this work for our community. Thank you to Bree Newsome, Takiyah Thompson, Maya Little, and so many others for taking huge risks to confront white supremacy relics head-on when what we refer to as "civil discussion" fails to bring about results.*

*Activists and organizers in other communities worked for \*years\* behind the scenes, and were met with resistance by those in power. Chatham County has just begun these public conversations. Tensions are already extremely high, with people taking sides. I urge the Board to come to a quick decision: living, breathing humans over property.*

*Sarah Beck submitted the following comments:*

*Hello. My name is Sarah Beck, and I am here today to express my support for the Chatham County Democrats resolution to return the confederate statue to the United Daughters of the Confederacy.*

*I have been a proud Southerner my whole life, and I've been lucky enough to call Chatham County my home for many years. However, I am ashamed of how long we have allowed the Confederate statue to stand. After 112 years in front of the courthouse where justice is served and where everyone is supposed to have equal protection under the law, it is time for the "common soldier" to come down. The monument was not placed by the UDC in the middle of Pittsboro to recognize the fallen confederate soldiers from Chatham County, and it was not placed there to preserve history. If this were the case, we would also see statues from the Revolutionary War, WW1 or WW2, even the Vietnam war. I mean plenty of Chatham County citizens died then. So why don't they have monuments in the middle of Town Square? The answer is simple. It's because the Confederate statue serves a different purpose. It was intentionally erected to intimidate, terrorize and send a clear message of hatred to the Black community. And what most people don't realize is that the monument was placed in 1907 which was almost half a century after the end of the Civil War. People also don't know that the UDC placed over 700 other monuments across the South in the early 1900s when America was plagued by Jim Crow segregation laws. The mass production and public placement of these statues was a targeted effort- to promote white supremacy in a time when Black Americans were just*

*starting to have a voice at the table. I would like think the intention of the monument was solely to represent lives lost in the war, and I know many of you would too, but the monument is a daily reminder of oppression and injustice for many Black residents in our community.*

*Removing the statue is the least we can do and it is only a small step in acknowledging the pain and suffering that is still endured by our Black neighbors today. I am asking you to act swiftly and strive to make our home a more inclusive and equitable place by returning the monument to its rightful owners. In the words of Martin Luther King Junior, "the time is always right to do what is right."*

*Robbin Whittington supports leaving the statue in its current location.*

*Maya Kricker submitted the following comments:*

*A Confederate sentinel guards the doorway of our courthouse, a monument to our history. You can't rewrite history, a history of the mass production in factories of hundreds of statues like this one. Ours, like the other monuments, was erected in the early 1900s by the United Daughters of the Confederacy at the height of violent efforts to prevent black people from voting and rampant lynchings throughout the South. The United Daughters of the Confederacy justified Jim Crow laws and glorified the Ku Klux Klan for "maintaining order." The UDC built a monument to the Klan in 1926.*

*That the majority of these monuments were built in front of court houses was no accident. The intent was to send a message that I understand all too well. In 1964 I was arrested in Albany, Georgia with 19 others while peacefully demonstrating for civil rights and social justice. We were told "You're not in Supreme Court country now." The judge handed out the sentence before the trial started. We were in jail for 28 days, that time.*

*In the 1960's, the height of the Civil Rights Movement, again statues were mass produced and erected in the South. The message was clear: Justice is a guarded privilege of whites and white supremacy is the rule of law in our courts.*

*Just last month The Highlander Social Justice Center in Tennessee, known for training Martin Luther King Jr., Rosa Parks and other civil rights leaders was bombed allegedly by a white supremacy group.*

*We can't rewrite history but we can make history. Today, when equal treatment by our justice systems remains a hope rather than a reality, I am asking you to remove the Confederate soldier with the gun and the terrible legacy he guards from the front of our courthouse as a message and a commitment that here in Chatham County we are all equal in the eyes of the law and our government institutions.*

*Stacy Leanza submitted the following comments:*

*I've got some thoughts about the Confederate Soldier statue, from the perspective of a white northerner, who grew up learning all about the civil rights movement, but nothing about the Civil War, other than from the Northern perspective.*

*First, history is written by the victors. And the victors of the Civil War are the Northern*

*White people. From my perspective, history has diminished the voices of the South, both black and white, to varying degrees. We Northerners have not heard much of your stories, and that isn't right. My point is that the conflict over the Confederate Statue is a symptom of a much bigger problem - the problem of power imbalances in the South. The voices of the regular people of the South, both black and white, aren't being heard or represented by those in power. Merely removing the statue won't resolve the conflict. It will be a small victory for the African American community and their progressive allies, but racism will still be alive and well. And it will further alienate the native Southerners, deepening the rift between the two groups. What's needed is reconciliation. The TRUE stories of the South, both black & white, need to be heard, by each other, and the rest of us - the real stories, underneath the arguments, justifications, & bravado. The only way to reconciliation and justice is to LISTEN. This is crucial! Once that happens, it will be easy to replace the Confederate soldier statues, that tell only a tiny part of one story, with ones that represent the WHOLE story.*

*Consider the irony of having such a statue outside of a "Hall of Justice". There can be no real justice with it here. The statue has become a potent symbol of this unresolved power imbalance! Let's remove it, and put it into a museum dedicated to reconciliation. Call for new artwork to represent ALL sides of the stories, and create a safe place for ALL people to tell their personal stories in a respectful way. And most importantly, a place where we can learn to listen with open minds to other people's stories, no matter who they are.*

*Honest communication is how true reconciliation happens - it's the only way! We can do this! Let's not stop at removing the statue.*

*Stacye Leanza  
165 Blue Heron Farm Rd.*

*...May I just add that, as an artist and trained consensus-based meeting facilitator, I would love to curate some kind of reconciliation project. It would so very much ease the hemorrhaging caused by the removal of the statue, if/when that should occur. It would, however need to be a paid position.*

*Ruth Meeks submitted the following comments:*

*Thank you ladies and gentlemen for allowing me to speak against the removal of the statue located on the courthouse grounds.*

*My name is Ruth Norwood Meeks. I am 75 years old, now living in Lee County, but grew up and went to school here in Pittsboro. My family ties can be traced back to the 1700's. I have ancestors who were granted land from the King of England and others that fought during the Revolutionary War. Family names are Boone, Eubanks, Hadley, Harris, Hearne, Norwood and I'm sure with a little more research I could find other familiar names. Today I am here to tell you about my great, great grandfather, Private Wiley Simeon Boon who was a farmer in the Hanks Chapel Church community. Simeon, as he was called by his family, was not a slave owner. He and his younger brother Charles joined the Confederate Army in September 1861. They trained at Camp Mangum near Raleigh and were assigned to Company D, the Haw River Boys, of the 35th Regiment in November 1861. After a poor showing in New Bern in the spring of 1862, the regiment was ordered to Malvern Hill, Va. Facing overwhelming Union forces, Pvt. Boon was killed on July 1, 1862. Simeon left behind a wife and son only 2 years old.*

*I now quote from the UDC Ritual.*

*"Almighty God, our Heavenly Father, we adore Thy love and providence in the history of our country, and especially would we thank Thee for our Confederate history. We thank Thee for its pure record of virtue, valor and sacrifice; and for the inspiring reflections that, despite its bitter disappointments and sorrow, it proclaims for us to all the world that we came through its years of trial and struggle with our battered shields pure, our character as a patriotic and courageous people untarnished and nothing to regret in our defense of the rights and the honor of our Southland."*

*The UDC was responsible for these statues placed to honor the bravery of husbands, fathers, and sons.*

*I claim the statue placed on the grounds of the courthouse to the honor and bravery of Pvt. Wiley Simeon Boon, one of the first casualties from Chatham County. Pvt. Boon gave his life protecting his family, home, Chatham County, and North Carolina and not for slavery.*

*Charles Lutterloh submitted the following comments:*

*My family came here in late 1700s. I grew up on a little dairy farm. No expert but know little about farm life and farm work.*

*150 years ago in simpler times farm life was quite different than today. If a landowner or farmer didn't have enough children and family to tend the farm he needed slaves. Not saying whether at that time it was right or wrong but that's just the way it was.*

*Most slave owners treated their slaves well because they needed the help. They worked side by side in the fields and on the farms. I can't say there was never any abuse by some but for the most part, good farmers were good to their slaves. I wish I could say there's no human trafficking today or no child abuse or no domestic abuse but I can't. These might be things we need to focus more on these days.*

*I respect all people, black, white, Latino, Oriental, whomever unless someone proves he doesn't deserve respect. I believe all humans are God's children and I believe all lives matter.*

*I am also convinced there are paid political activists traveling this country looking for a cause to support. They prey on young minds like college students. They get them fired up and let them do the dirty work, then they fade into the shadow. Did we see this in Durham and Chapel Hill recently?*

*The statue at the courthouse was put there as a memorial to the Confederate soldiers black and white from Chatham County who fought for a cause they believed in. Are we to say their lives didn't matter and send this memorial away? I don't think we should say that at all. I'm almost 71 years old and never in my lifetime has anyone told me this statue needed to go. It would be disrespectful to native Chathamites to have the monument. Are we to let political activists dictate policy for our county. I would hope not. Thank you for the time.*

*Larry Brooks submitted the following comments:*

*My name is Larry Brooks; I live at Meronies Church Road in Bear Creek. I am here tonight as a citizen of Chatham County but also as the President of the Western Chapter of the NAACP. As you know, the NAACP is the oldest, largest civil rights organization in the United States and was founded by an interracial group of people who exercised the courage of their convictions to combat racism and inequity in our country.*

*It is the official position of the National NAACP, as articulated by our President and CEO Derrick Jordan and stated on our website that, quote, "symbols of hatred and racism should not be venerated and although striking down statues, flags and memorials will not solve all the challenges concerning race and equality in America, it will symbolize an end to the reverence and celebration of values that have divided us too long."*

*Our NC state President William Barber has also said, "it's not enough just to take down statues, statutes that promote white supremacy need to be taken down as well. So, we are proud to join our sister chapters in South Carolina, Tennessee, Florida, Kentucky, Delaware and North Carolina in supporting the removal of symbols that invite, incite and validate both policies and actions that negatively affect the quality of life of any citizen in Chatham County.*

*Let me conclude by saying it is our hope that you decide to remove the statue and our hope as well that you review your local policies and those handed down to you by the general assembly and remove if you can, or, mitigate to the extent of your authority, any semblance of inequity in them. Thank you.*

*Julia Kennedy supports removing the Confederte monument.*

*Pete Szilvay supports leaving the statue in its current location.*

*Lamar Pender supports leaving the statue in its current location.*

*Calvin Conroy submitted the following comments:*

*Being a child growing up in Chatham County everytime I drove into Pittsboro I saw the statue standing there. I didn't understand why it was there. I didn't understand because it was erected in 1907 after the end of the Civil War, a whole generation later. It wasn't put there to embrace heritage, it was put there to cast fear upon the lives of African Americans.*

*I feel like the day it was erected it cast a shadow on Chatham County. And for 112 years this shadow has stayed on Chatham County. Its 2019 and its time to change, its time to cast aside the hate. I want to grow up in a county that embraces our true American values! Love, Freedom, and Opportunities for all. I want to live in a county that's pushing forward into the future, not trying to live in a bad time in the past. THIS IS 2019! ITS TIME TO TAKE IT DOWN! Thank you for your time*

*Chip LeRoy supports leaving the statue in its current location.*

*John Shirley supports leaving the statue in its current location.*

*Billy Cummings supports giving the Confederate monument back to the UDC.*

*John Graybeal submitted the following comments:*

*I agree with those who believe the statue should be removed or relocated.*

*However, the NC General Assembly – I will not say "in its infinite wisdom" --- passed a statute that prohibits removal or relocation of such statues except under certain circumstances. NCGS sec. 100-2.1. That statute exempts statues in two situations that may be relevant here:*

*(1) "An object of remembrance owned by a private party that is located on public property and that is the subject of a legal agreement between the private party and the State or a political subdivision of the State governing the removal or relocation of the object;" and*

*(2) "An object of remembrance for which a building inspector or similar official has determined poses a threat to public safety because of an unsafe or dangerous condition."*

*If either of these exceptions apply, the statue may simply be removed. However, if it would make sense for the Board to seek to return the statue to the Daughters of the Confederacy or to relocate it in the Chatham Historical Museum or elsewhere.*

*As for this first exception, it could be argued that the Order passed by the Commissioners on July 8, 1907 is not "a legal agreement between" the Daughters of the Confederacy and the County and it could be argued that the Order does not "govern the removal or relocation" of the statue.*

*However, declining to remove the statue for those reasons would require a highly close and technical reading of the statute. I believe the statue here falls within the spirit of this exception because it is owned by a private party, is located on public property and the 1907 Order can be read to incorporate a presumption that the Commissioners did not intend to grant the Daughters the right to leave the statue in that location forever.*

*Although the better and stronger argument is that the statue falls within the first exception, you must face the possibility that some might disagree and that a lawsuit could be filed to prevent the removal of the statue.*

*With this in mind, you may have several other courses of action:*

- 1. Announce an intention to remove the statue on a certain future date in order to see whether litigation is threatened.*
- 2. File a lawsuit yourself asking a court to declare that you have the legal right to remove the statue.*
- 3. As some have suggested, place certain other statues at the courthouse, e.g., a statue of a Union soldier, a statue of Martin Luther King, Jr., and/or other similar statues.*

4. *There may be other options, including leaving things as they are.*

*As for the second exception, there may be reason to believe that the statue poses "a threat to public safety."*

*John Wagner supports removing the Confederate monument.*

*EP Ackers supports leaving the statute in its current location.*

*Kim Beal supports leaving the statue in its current location.*

*Bryan Cochran supports removing the statue from the courthouse.*

*Michael Manninng supports removing the statue from the courthouse.*

*Vaughn Upshaw supports removing the statue from the courthouse.*

*Janet Pate supports leaving the statue in its current location.*

*Mike Wiley supports removing the statue from the courthouse.*

*Scott Gilmore supports leaving the statue in its current location.*

*Nathan Conroy supports removing the statue from the courthouse.*

[19-3033](#)

Presentation by Chatham For All: Following a year and a half of individual comment, information and requests, Chatham For All, a group of Chatham residents, will talk about the Confederate monument in front of the Courthouse and request that the Commissioners return it to its owner, the United Daughters of the Confederacy.

**Attachments:**    [Chair Dasher Monument Remarks](#)  
[Chatham For All Request and Supporting Information](#)  
[Chatham For All Letter to BOC 4.15.19](#)  
[Howard Fifer Remarks 4.15.19](#)  
[Carl Thompson Remarks 4.15.19](#)  
[Chris Kaman Remarks 4.15.19](#)  
[Emily Moose Remarks 4.15.19](#)  
[Commissioners Meeting Statue Presentation 4.15.19](#)

*Commissioner Howard stated as the sole minority on the Board she could tell if a person was for keeping the statue or for removing the statue based on whether they actually looked at her. She heard the words "We" and "Us" used as an exclusion, not inclusively. She believes "We" and "Us" are inclusionary only. She also heard people say most people or their relatives did not own slaves. The connotation being that there were people and then there were slaves. That was not the situation. There were people owning other people in an institution of slavery. Commissioner Howard stated she does not have the privilege and honor of knowing who her great-great grandfather was or even where he came from. If a symbol does not adequately reflect respect and honor and lift up all of us it doesn't reflect all of us. She would like to see the County's African American population grow because they feel included and supported.*

*Vice Chair Hales stated she appreciates that so many people from Chatham County came out to participate and share their concerns. Chatham County has been her home for thirty-five years. She believes the statue was placed in the most prominent civic square. It is where everyone came to do business.*

*Commissioner Howard made a motion to direct staff to further investigate the County's opportunity to remove the statue and re-offer it to the United Daughter's of the Confederacy. Vice Chair Hales seconded the motion.*

*Chair Dasher clarified for those in attendance that the motion is for the Board to refer the item to the County Attorney for an opinion. That is all.*

*Commissioner Petty said he believes the motion sounds like the decision to remove it has already been made. He does not believe this is a win-win situation. Not everyone is going to be happy with the outcome. Keeping the statue or removing it is not going to fix the problem. Somehow we have to find a way to come out of this stronger and without more division and separation. Slavery was and is wrong. No one should own another person. If we can define the true purpose of that statue then the decision is easy. That is the challenge. He would like to see the motion read to instruct the attorney to tell the Board what the options are. He believes the motion sounds like the decision has been made to move it.*

*Commissioner Howard said if the option is to keep that statue where it is then there is nothing left to do. The only action item would be an action toward removal.*

**A motion was made by Commissioner Howard, seconded by Vice Chair Hales, to direct staff to look at the opportunities for removing the statue and returning it to the United Daughters of the Confederacy. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 4 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford and Commissioner Howard

No: 1 - Commissioner Petty

### **MANAGER' S REPORTS**

*Mr. LaMontagne reminded the Commissioners that the Opening Ceremonies for Senior Games will be held April 26th and that most staff offices will be closed Friday, April 19. He told Commissioner Petty that it been a pleasure working with him and that he appreciates working with him and him friendship.*

### **COMMISSIONERS' REPORTS**

*Commissioner Howard stated the Durham light rail is off the agenda. The NCACC Bylaws Committee met and is presenting a redrafting of the bylaws to the executive board in May and to the general membership in August. This will also be the end of Commissioner Howard's term with the Executive Board as she is transitioning to the Education Board.*

*Commissioner Crawford met with many legislators last month both as a member of the Board of Trustees for CCCC regarding the capital fund and on behalf of TJCOG for the One Water initiative. He is hopeful that things may be able to move forward in a bipartisan fashion.*

*Vice Chair Hales has attended a number of water meetings in the past month, including the Jordan Lake Nutrient Management Research Symposium with a lot of people from UNC. A lot of scientific work has been done, it's now time to bring the strands together. There will be a very good study when it's all together. Coming up this Wednesday there is another One Water meeting. Vice Chair Hales and Commissioner Petty will be going to a special open house at Mountaire for elected officials to see the process. She also went to the SOG Basics of County Human Services and Mr. LaMontagne went the next day when they talked about Medicaid. A lot of worrisome items were brought forward that Vice Chair Hales would like to discuss with staff.*

*Chair Dasher had the pleasure of welcoming people to the legal fair held by the Hispanic Liaison last weekend. It was a well-attended and informative event.*

### **ADJOURNMENT**

**A motion was made by Vice Chair Hales, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this be adjourned. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Crawford, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty