

Chatham County, NC

Meeting Minutes

Board of Commissioners

Monday, July 15, 2024

2:00 PM

Historic Courthouse Courtroom

Work Session - 2:00 PM - Historic Courthouse Courtroom

Present: 5 - Chair Mike Dasher, Vice Chair Karen Howard, Commissioner David Delaney, Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores and Commissioner Katie Kenlan

ADJUSTMENTS AND APPROVAL OF WORK SESSION AGENDA

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Katie Kenlan, that the work session agenda was approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

PUBLIC COMMENT SESSION

No one signed up to speak.

BOARD PRIORITIES

24-5399

Receive a presentation from Capital Area Metropolitan Planning Organization (CAMPO)

CAMPO Presentation Attachments:

Representatives from the Capital Area Metropolitan Planning Organization (CAMPO) presented an overview of the organization. The Representatives included Executive Director Chris Lukasina, Deputy Director Shelby Powell and Deputy Director Alex Rickard.

The representatives stated that Capital Area Metropolitan Planning Organization is comprised of elected officials and staff representing six counties and twenty-one municipal jurisdictions, plus North Carolina Department of Transportation and GoTriangle. The counties include all of Wake and parts of Chatham, Franklin, Granville, Harnett, & Johnston. The combined 2021 population of the coverage is 1.4 million, which is approximately twelve percent of North Carolina. A new Memorandum of Understanding adoption is currently underway for Chatham County.

The Capital Area Metropolitan Planning Organization's committees typically meet monthly, with breaks in July and December. The Executive Board is comprised mostly of member governments' elected officials, North Carolina Department of Transportation board member(s), and other agency representatives. The Technical Coordinating Committee is comprised of government and agency staff members and advises the

Executive Board on technical issues.

The Capital Area Metropolitan Planning Organization funding for planning includes the following:

- 1. Planning funds allocated by the Federal Highway Administration to Metropolitan Planning Organizations based on population and are administered by North Carolina Department of Transportation Planning Division.
- 2. Surface Transportation Block Grant Program- Direct Attributable, which are supplied by United States Department of Transportation to Metropolitan Planning Organizations with 200,000 or more population. These funds are meant to cover additional planning and project requirements of larger urban areas. These funds are programmed in the Unified Work Program and through LAPP.
- 3. State Planning Research Funds These funds are available through North Carolina Department of Transportation for use on special studies or planning efforts and typically applied to the large regional planning studies. The application process is through the North Carolina Department of Transportation Planning Division.
- 4. Federal Transit Administration Funds these funds are from Sec. 5307, 5310, and 5339. These funds are used by transit agencies to conduct planning work. The use of these funds for planning is included in the Metropolitan Planning Organization Unified Planning Work Program.
- 5. Wake Transit Funding Funds allocated through the annual Wake Transit Work Program. These funds are used to fund Wake Transit staff annually, with special allocations for periodical plans and studies. Wake Transit Plan is updated every four years.

The Locally Administered Projects Program include Metropolitan Planning Organization's with 200,000+ population that receive direct designated Federal funding (State Planning Research Funds-Direct Attributable, Transportation Alternatives Program-Direct Attributable, which was created in 2011 to give Capital Area Metropolitan Planning Organization a technically sound, equitable method of project funding. This is a holistic approach to identifying and prioritizing small but highly effective projects and to avoid future Federal rescissions to the maximum extent possible.

The Locally Administered Projects Program Staff works with the Locally Administered Projects Program Selection Committee to maintain a project prioritization system and schedule, evaluate annual submissions and recommend projects, establish annual guide for modal investment mix, quantitative based scoring criteria by mode, only scored within mode. The projects ranked based on local priority, Metropolitan Transportation Plan compliance, prior agency funding level, project effectiveness, and cost effectiveness.

Locally Administered Projects Program key dates include spring Locally Administered Projects Program Steering Committee recommends technical criteria and target modal mix, summer Executive Board reviews criteria and modal mix, and opens comment period, August Locally Administered Projects Program call for projects opens, October Locally Administered Projects Program call for projects closes, November through December projects reviewed and scored by staff and the Selection Panel, and in January and February, the Executive Board considers recommended list for approval.

A Comprehensive Transportation Plan is a multi-modal long-range vision plan that defines an organization's philosophy towards decisions related to the integration of transportation and land use for highway plan, public transit and rail plan, bicycle and pedestrian plan. The plan depicts transportation infrastructure needed to handle the

area's projected traffic for a minimum thirty to fifty year planning horizon and planning beyond the Metropolitan Transportation Plan horizon years.

A Metropolitan Transportation Plan is federally mandated to emphasis on preservation and efficiency improvement of existing system, planning horizon of at least twenty years, but twenty-five is preferred, plans for all modes of transportation, fiscally constrained; not a wish list, and has extensive public involvement. Planning activities that feed into the Metropolitan Transportation Plan large area studies include corridor studies, and hot spot studies. Other special studies or modal studies include local land use and transportation plans and transit plans.

The Unified Planning Work Program serves as both the annual budget and the guide to work tasks for the Metropolitan Planning Organization staff. The Unified Planning Work Program Core Mission Work Tasks include developing and maintaining the required transportation planning documents such as the Comprehensive Transportation Plan/Metropolitan Transportation Plan and TIP, assist with the effective disbursement of LAPP program. The Unified Planning Work Program Non-Core Mission Work Tasks include partnering with local or state member agencies to advance transportation planning efforts in a particular area or corridor, which generally require additional local match from beneficiary member jurisdictions and/or other partner agencies/organizations.

FY 2025 Unified Planning Work Program and Metropolitan Planning Organization Self-Certification is for new studies including Capital Area Metropolitan Planning Organization / Durham Chapel Hill Metropolitan Planning Organization Joint Rail Strategy Study, Northwest Area Study, Bus Rapid Transit Regional Transportation Plan – Clayton Concept of Operations Study, and implementation of the updated Metropolitan Transportation Plan Bicycle Pedestrian Element.

The continuing studies for FY 2024 include the Apex Railyard Relocation Study, Capital Area Metropolitan Planning Organization Regional Multi-Modal Safety Action Plan, NW Harnett Transit Feasibility Study, Wake Transit Plan Update, and the Triangle Bikeway National Environmental Policy Act / Design.

The member share budget is \$0.74 - \$0.77 per Capita and the indirect cost estimate is \$175,000.

Other Metropolitan Planning Organization programs include travel demand modeling, transportation demand management, technical assistance, safe routes to schools, congestion management process, council of planning for US 1 Corridor, Metropolitan Planning Organization public participation & Title VI, mobility coordination committee, and the regional mobility management program.

The Board of Commissioners thanked the Capital Area Metropolitan Planning Organization team for the presentation and shared the importance of being a member of the organization.

This Agenda Item was received and filed.

24-5403 Receive a presentation on the Draft Unified Development Ordinance Module 2

Memo and provide direction to the consultant team for Unified Development

Ordinance revisions

<u>Attachments:</u> Module 2 Memo Presentation

Unified Development Ordinance Consultants with White and Smith LLC reviewed and discussed the following items with the Board of Commissioners: Street lighting, Open Space, Parking, Signs, Alternatives to Tree Save Areas, Tree Protection, and Subdivisions. proposed Unified Development Ordinance

The Board of Commissioners had a lengthy discussion with the consultants and gave them guidance.

This Agenda Item was referred to the Planning Department.

End of Work Session

RECESS

Regular Session - 6:00 PM - Historic Courthouse Courtroom

Present: 5 - Chair Mike Dasher, Vice Chair Karen Howard, Commissioner David Delaney, Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores and Commissioner Katie Kenlan

INVOCATION and PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

CALL TO ORDER

ADJUSTMENTS AND APPROVAL OF REGULAR SESSION AGENDA

Clerk to the Board Jenifer Johnson requested the addition of item 24-5483 Vote to approve a resolution authorizing the execution of Kroger Opioid Settlement and approving the second supplemental agreement for additional funds to be added to the Consent Agenda.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Katie Kenlan, to approve the regular session agenda as amended. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA

24-5397 Vote to approve the November 15, 2021 Work and Regular Session Minutes

Attachments: 11-15-2021 Minutes Draft as of 6-25-2024

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve the November 15, 2021 Work and Regular Session Minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5369 Vote to approve the June 5, 2023 Work and Regular Session Minutes

Attachments: 6-5-2023 Minutes Draft

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve the June 5, 2023 Work and Regular Session Minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5370 Vote to approve the June 20, 2023 Work and Regular Session Minutes

Attachments: 6-20-2023 Minutes Draft

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve the June 20, 2023 Work and Regular Session Minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

Vote to approve the November 21, 2023 Capital Improvements Plan Work Session Minutes

Attachments: 11-21-2023 Minutes Draft

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve the November 21, 2023 Capital Improvements Plan Work Session Minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5398 Vote to approve the May 21, 2024 Budget Public Hearing Minutes

Attachments: 5-21-2024 Minutes Draft

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve the May 21, 2024 Budget Public Hearing Minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5421 Vote to approve the May 23 and May 24, 2024 Budget Work Session Minutes

Attachments: 5-23-2024 Minutes Draft

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve the May 23 and May 24, 2024 Budget Work Session Minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5422 Vote to approve the June 17, 2024 Work and Regular Session Minutes

Attachments: 6-17-2024 Minutes Draft

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve the June 17, 2024 Work and Regular Session Minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5431 Vote to adopt the Project Ordinance for the Hatley Road Looping Watermain

<u>Attachments:</u> Project Ordinance Hatley Road Looping Watermain

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to adopt the Project Ordinance for the Hatley Road Looping Watermain. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5432 Vote to adopt the Project Ordinance for the Chatham County Detention Center Generator

Attachments: Project Ordinance Chatham County Detention Center Generator

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to adopt the Project Ordinance for the Chatham County Detention Center Generator. The motion failed by the following vote:

24-5433 Vote to adopt the amended Fiber Optic Cabling Project Ordinance that will directly connect the Chatham County Backup Emergency Operations Center and Siler City Health Clinic to the core county network

Attachments: Project Ordinance Fiber Optic Cabling From Pittsboro to EOC Backup
Center in Siler City - Amendment Jul 15

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to adopt the amended Fiber Optic Cabling Project Ordinance that will directly connect the Chatham County Backup Emergency Operations Center and Siler City Health Clinic to the core county network. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

Vote to adopt the amended Project Ordinance for the Chatham County
 Northwest District Park Dam (Camp Maranatha Lake Dam)

<u>Attachments:</u> Project Ordinance Northwest District Park Dam - Amendment Jul 15

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to adopt the amended Project Ordinance for the Chatham County Northwest District Park Dam (Camp Maranatha Lake Dam). The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5435 Vote to amend the Fiscal Year 2023-2024 Budget Ordinance

Attachments: Budget Amendment 2023-2024 Jul 15

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to amend the Fiscal Year 2023-2024 Budget Ordinance. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

Vote to reappoint Ashley Pappas, PharmD, MHA, to fill a second (2nd) term on the Board of Health as a pharmacist member, effective July 1, 2024, with a term expiring on June 30, 2027

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to reappoint Ashley Pappas, PharmD, MHA, to fill a second (2nd) term on the Board of Health as a pharmacist member, effective July 1, 2024, with a term expiring on June 30, 2027. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

Vote to appoint Reginald Horton and reappoint Sharon Day to the Agricultural Advisory Board for three-year terms expiring on June 30, 2027

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to appoint Reginald Horton and reappoint Sharon Day to the Agricultural Advisory Board for three-year terms expiring on June 30, 2027. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

Vote to change the appointment of David Morton (District 2) and Gary Cox (District 3) to full board member appointments for the Affordable Housing Advisory Committee

A motion was made by Vice Chair Howard, seconded by Commissioner Gomez Flores, to change the appointment of David Morton (District 2) and Gary Cox (District 3) to full board member appointments for the Affordable Housing Advisory Committee. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

Vote to accept \$237,243 for the five-year Public Health Infrastructure Workforce Development funding from the CDC through NC DHHS to support staff development with a focus on the public health foundational capabilities (carryover funds)

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to accept \$237,243 for the five-year Public Health Infrastructure Workforce Development funding from the CDC through NC DHHS to support staff development with a focus on the public health foundational

24-5334

24-5387

24-5438

capabilities (carryover funds). The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5390 Vote to accept \$68,324.00 funds for COVID-19 vaccination support through the Bridge Access Program (carryover funds)

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to accept \$68,324.00 funds for COVID-19 vaccination support through the Bridge Access Program (carryover funds). The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5391 Vote to accept \$50,000 in additional Aid to County funding from NCDHHS (ARPA Temporary Savings Fund for Public Health Services) to support delivery of essential public health services (carryover funds)

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to accept \$50,000 in additional Aid to County funding from NCDHHS (ARPA Temporary Savings Fund for Public Health Services) to support delivery of essential public health services (carryover funds). The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

Vote to accept \$1,500 in National Environmental Public Health Internship
 Program (NEPHIP) Funds to purchase a tablet for food safety inspection work

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to accept \$1,500 in National Environmental Public Health Internship Program (NEPHIP) Funds to purchase a tablet for food safety inspection work. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5427 Vote to accept \$141,800.10 for the North Carolina Capacity Building Competitive Grant to purchase restroom/shower trailers to support disaster sheltering and major incident response

Attachments: Grant Award Letter from NCCBCG

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to accept \$141,800.10 for the North Carolina Capacity Building Competitive Grant to purchase restroom/shower trailers to support disaster sheltering and major incident response. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

Vote to award the recreation grants to Sprott Youth Center for \$7,550 and Pittsboro Skatepark for \$12,750 as recommended by the Recreation Advisory Committee

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to award the recreation grants to Sprott Youth Center for \$7,550 and Pittsboro Skatepark for \$12,750 as recommended by the Recreation Advisory Committee. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5393 Vote to approve a contract with Delta Dental for three years for the Special Healthcare Needs Benefit

Attachments: Delta Dental 3 year contract 7-1-2024 thru 2027 Final

Enhanced Dental Benefit Flyer

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve a contract with Delta Dental for three years for the Special Healthcare Needs Benefit. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

Vote to approve a contract with Artic Wolf, a comprehensive network monitoring and vulnerability management platform with 24x7x365 monitoring, and a dedicated Concierge Team for Chatham County that will identify early cyber threats for one (1) year of service

Attachments: Artic Wolf 1 year contract 7-15-2024

Artic Wolf Executive Overview

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve a contract with Artic Wolf, a comprehensive network monitoring and vulnerability management platform with 24x7x365 monitoring, and a dedicated Concierge Team for Chatham County that will identify early cyber threats for one (1) year of service. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

Vote to approve a contract between the Chatham County Public Health
Department and Chatham County Schools for school nursing and health and
wellness program facilitator positions

Attachments: FY25 Health Dept. and Schools Contract

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve a contract between the Chatham County Public Health Department and Chatham County Schools for school nursing and health and wellness program facilitator positions. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

Vote to approve a contract with Chatham Economic Development Corporation

<u>24-5400</u>

24-5396

24-5394

for FY25

Attachments: Economic Development Corporation Contract FY24-25

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve a contract with Chatham Economic Development Corporation for FY25. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5410

Vote to approve a contract with The Wooten Company for Task Order No.1 for the Hatley Road Water Main Extension Project in the amount of \$342,700.00

Attachments: FY25 Wooten Company Task Order 1 - Hatley Road Watermain

Extension

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve a contract with The Wooten Company for Task Order No.1 for the Hatley Road Water Main Extension Project in the amount of \$342,700.00. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5412

Vote to approve a contract with North Carolina Administrative Office of the Courts for Inquiry-Only Access for eWarrants

Attachments:

Inquiry-Only Privacy and Security Requirements for eWarrants

<u>05282024</u>

<u>Inquiry-Only User Agreement for eWarrants-Chatham Co Pretrial</u>

Services 05302024

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve a contract with North Carolina Administrative Office of the Courts for Inquiry-Only Access for eWarrants. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5439

Vote to approve the contract with the Moncure Fire Department of the Fire Training Facility

<u>Attachments:</u> FY24 Contract Moncure Fire Training Facility - Draft 7.10

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve the contract with the Moncure Fire Department of the Fire Training Facility. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5425

Vote to approve annual agreement with NC Forest Service

Attachments: FY25 Forestry Contract

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve annual agreement with NC Forest Service. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5415 Vote to approve Tax Releases and Refunds

<u>Attachments:</u> June 2024 Release and Refund Report

June 2024 NCVTS Pending Refund Report

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve Tax Releases and Refunds. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5420 Vote to approve the Order of Collection for 2024 property taxes

Attachments: Order to Jenny Williams Tax Collector

A motion was made by Vice Chair Howard, seconded by Commissioner Gomez Flores, to approve the Order of Collection for 2024 property taxes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5423 Vote to adopt a resolution approving the Tax Collector's Annual Settlement and charging the Tax Collector with collections of delinquent taxes

Attachments: Resolution Approving Tax Collector's Annual Settlement

2023-2024 Annual Settlement

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to adopt a resolution 24-25 approving the Tax Collector's Annual Settlement and charging the Tax Collector with collections of delinquent taxes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5418 Vote to approve the naming of one private road in Chatham County listed as Poe Farm Road

<u>Attachments:</u> Poe Farm RD petition

Poe Farm Rd map

Poe Farm Rd area map

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve the naming of one private road in Chatham County listed as Poe Farm Road. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5428

Vote to approve the naming of two (2) private roads in Chatham County listed as Ruth Woods Lane and Gib Ruth Lane

Attachments: Ruth Woods Ln; Gib Ruth Lane Petition

Ruth Woods Ln; Gib Ruth Lane map

Ruth Morrow Lane Area Map

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve the naming of two (2) private roads in Chatham County listed as Ruth Woods Lane and Gib Ruth Lane. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5401

Vote to adopt a resolution authorizing procedures for staff to surplus inventory in the Chatham County Public Libraries

Attachments: Resolution Approving the surplus and disposal process for Chatham

County Libraries 2024

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to adopt a resolution 24-26 authorizing procedures for staff to surplus inventory in the Chatham County Public Libraries. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5405

Vote to adopt a resolution declaring a 1.038-acre county-owned property surplus located at 333 New Elam Church Road and authorize its sale to the North Carolina Department of Transportation at the negotiated purchase price of \$225,000

Attachments: Resolution Approving the surplus and disposal New Elam Church

Road property 2024

Aerial of Property Located at 333 New Elam Church Road

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Katie Kenlan, to adopt a resolution 24-27 declaring a 1.038-acre county-owned property surplus located at 333 New Elam Church Road and authorize its sale to the North Carolina Department of Transportation at the negotiated purchase price of \$225,000. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5414

Vote to adopt a resolution for the Interlocal Agreement with the Town of Pittsboro for landscaping and grounds maintenance of the Historic Courthouse Circle

<u>Attachments:</u> <u>Historic Courthouse Grounds Agreement with Town of Pittsboro</u>

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to adopt a resolution 24-28 for the Interlocal Agreement with the Town of Pittsboro for landscaping and grounds maintenance of the Historic Courthouse Circle. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

<u>24-5407</u>

Vote to adopt a resolution authorizing the Towns of Fuquay Varina and Holly Springs to Acquire Real Property in Chatham County

Attachments:

Resolution Authorizing Fuquay Varina and Holly Springs to Acquire
Property 7-15-2024

A motion was made by Vice Chair Howard, seconded by Commissioner Gomez Flores, to adopt a resolution 24-29 authorizing the Towns of Fuquay Varina and Holly Springs to Acquire Real Property in Chatham County. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5408

Vote to adopt a resolution approving a legislative request by Gunjan and Vikas Laad on Parcel 96061, located off Farrington Point Road, being approximately 19.43 acres, to rezone from R-1 Residential to CD-NB Conditional District Neighborhood Business, for an Event Center Limited, Williams Township

Attachments: More information from the Planning department website

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to adopt a resolution 24-30 approving a legislative request by Gunjan and Vikas Laad on Parcel 96061, located off Farrington Point Road, being approximately 19.43 acres, to rezone from R-1 Residential to CD-NB Conditional District Neighborhood Business, for an Event Center Limited, Williams Township. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5299

Vote to adopt a resolution approving a rezoning requested by Renago Inc to rezone Parcel 5626, located on Christian Chapel Church Rd., from R-1 Residential to Ind-H Heavy Industrial, being 37 acres, Cape Fear Township

<u>Attachments:</u> More information from the Planning department website

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to adopt a resolution 24-31 approving a rezoning requested by Renago Inc to rezone Parcel 5626, located on Christian Chapel Church Rd., from R-1 Residential to Ind-H Heavy Industrial, being 37 acres, Cape Fear Township. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5402

Vote to adopt a resolution approving a request by Sam Nye, P.E. for subdivision First Plat review of Ridgewood Hills, consisting of 25 lots on 130.306 acres, located off Hatley Road, parcel 17357

<u>Attachments:</u> More information from the Planning department website

Minority Report Ridgewood-Colbert

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to adopt a resolution 24-32 approving a request by Sam Nye, P.E. for subdivision First Plat review of Ridgewood Hills, consisting of 25 lots on 130.306 acres, located off Hatley Road, parcel 17357. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5400

Vote to adopt a resolution approving the addition of the 0.74 miles Sunset Grove Drive, 0.21 miles Boxwood Drive, 0.25 miles Starwood Drive, 0.11 miles Shadow Ridge Way, and 0.09 miles New Castle Court in the Sunset Grove Subdivision

Attachments: Resolution Sunset Grove Subdivision Addition 7-15-2024

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to adopt a resolution 24-33 approving the addition of the 0.74 miles Sunset Grove Drive, 0.21 miles Boxwood Drive, 0.25 miles Starwood Drive, 0.11 miles Shadow Ridge Way, and 0.09 miles New Castle Court in the Sunset Grove Subdivision. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

24-5483

Vote to approve a resolution authorizing the execution of Kroger Opioid Settlement and approving the second supplemental agreement for additional funds

<u>Attachments:</u> Resolution to Authorize the Execution of Kroger Opioid Settlement

and Approving Second Supplement Agreement
Action Required Kroger National Opioid Settl

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Franklin Gomez Flores, to approve a resolution 24-34 authorizing the execution of Kroger Opioid Settlement and approving the second supplemental agreement for additional funds. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan

End of Consent Agenda

PUBLIC COMMENT SESSION

No one signed up to speak.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

24-5409

A quasi-judicial public hearing requested by Southern Towers BTS, LP for a Special Use Permit for a new 285 ft wireless telecommunications tower on Parcel 60359, located at 4162 Bonlee Bennett Rd., being an area of .66 acres out of the 29-acre tract, Bear Creek Township

Attachments: More information from the Planning department website

Chair Dasher resumed the quasi-judicial public hearing requested by Southern Towers BTS, LP for a Special Use Permit for a new 285 ft wireless telecommunications tower on Parcel 60359, located at 4162 Bonlee Bennett Rd., being an area of .66 acres out of the 29-acre tract, Bear Creek Township that was started at the June 17, 2024 Board of Commissioners meeting.

Chair Dasher noted that the Board of Commissioners is required to act in a quasi-judicial capacity as it receives evidence and makes a decision. Dasher stated that this means that the applicant is entitled to a full evidentiary hearing. During this hearing the Board of Commissioners will receive legally acceptable evidence to establish sufficient facts to apply the ordinance.

Chair Dasher invited anyone that was going to speak on the item to stand for an oath. Dasher administered the following oath to those standing: Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence or testimony you are about to provide is factual and truthful to the best of your knowledge. Those standing replied yes.

Zoning Administrator Angela Plummer stated that Planning Staff had no additional information since the June 17, 2024 presentation and the applicant is here along with some adjacent property owners.

Calvin Marsh - Adjacent Property Owner

I spoke during the last session and brought my neighbors here so they can address you themselves.

Tracy Hanner - Adjacent Property Owner

Thank you for allowing me to provide written comments prior to the July 15th meeting of the Board of Commissioners as it relates to the public hearing requested by Southern Towers BTS, LP for a special use permit for a nearby 285 foot wireless telecommunications tower on land parcel 60359, located at 4162 Bonlee Bennett Rd, in the Bear Creek Township. As I stated earlier in my email, my wife Gwendolyn and I are both cancer survivors of 6 and 16 years respectively. We attended the informal community meeting held on April 13, 2024, at the Harpers Crossroads Community Center hosted by southern Towers BTS, LP. We expressed our concerns at that time since the location of the Tower is just next door to our residential location. Although we are internet and cell phone technology starved in our area, we still have reservations about the location of the tower. As a resident of this community, I am writing to express my deep concern and strong opposition to the proposed installation of a cell phone tower near our home. Gwendolyn and I have personally battled cancer, I am particularly alarmed by the potential health risks that the proximity to such a tower may pose, especially being more vulnerable and susceptible to the potential adverse effects of electromagnetic radiation which could increase the risk of cancer recurrence. It took a while to do some research homework on the subject to educate myself and to be able to intelligently express our concerns which are stated below with references: 1. Health Concerns: Scientific Evidence: Several reputable studies have raised concerns about the potential health risks associated with long-term exposure to electromagnetic radiation from cell phone towers. For instance, the International Agency for Research on Cancer (IARC) has classified radio frequency electromagnetic

fields as "possibly carcinogenic to humans" (Group 2B), indicating a potential link to cancer (IARC, 2011). Moreover, a study conducted in Belo Horizonte, Brazil, reported higher cancer mortality rates among individuals living close to cell phone towers (Dode et al., 201. I). Vulnerability Due to Past Cancer: As a cancer survivor, my concern is compounded by the evidence suggesting that individuals ,with prior health conditions may be more suscept. Ible to the potential adverse effects of electromagnetic radiation. Research indicates that cumulative exposure to such radiation could increase the risk of cancer recurrence or other health complications (Khurana et a.J., 2010). 2. Community Impact: Broader Health Risks: It is crucial to consider the broader community's health, including vulnerable populations such as children and the elderly. Studies have shown that younger individuals, who absorb more microwave radiation due to their physiology, are particularly at risk (Morgan et al , 2014). The long-term implications of chronic exposure in a residential area could be profound and far- reaching. Property Values and Aesthetic Concerns: Beyond health risks, the presence of a cell tower could detract from the aesthetic value of our neighborhood and potentially lower property values. We expressed our concern at the informal meeting about property value changes. This could have economic repercussions for all residents, not just those in immediate proximity. 3. Request for Reevaluation: Alternative Solutions: I urge the Board of Commissioners, relevant authorities and stakeholders to reconsider the proposed location of this tower. Alternative sites away from residential areas should be thoroughly explored to mitigate potential health risks and address community concerns. According to the supplementary documents submitted to the County of Chatham, site selection analysis was done by Airosmith Development for Southern Towers. Nine parcels in our area were analyzed and it appears only two were interested in having the tower located on their property. Most were not interested or did not respond. It's also stated in the search ring analysis that even this site selection does not guarantee to provide adequate service. Shouldn't it be a guarantee if you are risking the health of nearby citizens. Community Involvement: The decision-making process should actively involve community members, particularly those most affected and we appreciate the County notices, notifications of meeting date, and allowing the community to speak. However, Transparent discussions and considerations of scientific evidence and public health should guide the final decision. In light of these significant concerns, I respectfully request that the proposed cell phone tower installation be halted and re-evaluated with due regard to the health and well-being of the community. I would ask that the Chatham County Health Department authorities look into the health risk and provide further research assessment before the board makes their final decision. The person we see benefiting the most is the owner of the property who will receive a hefty compensation at our potential health risk expense.

Gwendolyn Fox Hanner - Adjacent Property Owner

My name is Gwendolyn Fox Hanner. I live at 4320 Bonlee Bennett Rd, Bear Creek NC 27207. I have been at this basic address for my entire life. My daddy bought this land from James Gilbert, who was a white man, during the era of Segregation and Jim Crow laws. He didn't seem to care that black people lived nearby. At this time people seemed to care about the land and other people. We never had any trouble in our neighborhood. Everyone seemed to get along. We knew each other's names. I think the new owner of this land may not have taken into consideration how we will be affected by the location of this cellphone tower in our residential area. My reason for speaking this evening is to let you know that I vehemently oppose the tower that has been planned for our area. I want you to take into consideration that both my husband and I and my cousin Barbara are cancer survivors. We really don't need something that will exacerbate our conditions and possibly cause new ones. I realize that we were told that there would be a minimal amount of EM radiation and that it would cause us no

harm. Any amount of radiation exposure is harmful. I have several conditions that I am battling. All of which have to do with my immune system. I am sure I do not need any more radiation than I have already had. Knowing this about the radiation waves and our exposure to them and knowing that our property values will decline because of this tower, I urge you not to approve it. The person who will benefit monetarily by this tower lives a great distance away and will not be affected by the tower itself. I wonder if he would like a tower of this nature near his home. As I stated earlier, our health will be affected by this tower and our property values will decline. What will we have to leave to our children and grandchildren, but a cancer-ridden area with low property values? If you look around this room, you will notice four black people who will be greatly impacted by this, health and property wise. There are no white people in this same state here this evening. I don't want to make any accusations, but how does this look to you? How will it look to others? In conclusion, people of color have been and continue to be disenfranchised in this country, whether it be by healthcare or land ownership, jobs etc. Don't let Chatham County NC become the next to disenfranchise a group of people for the sake of the love of money.

Tami Lewallen, agent for the applicant Southern Towers BBTS, LP Stated that she was here to answer any questions.

Matthew Butcher, RF Engineer Shared a report showing no immediate health risks associated with the tower.

Richard Kirkland, Kirkland Appraisals, LLC Shared a report showing no adverse effect on property values due to a cell tower being in close proximity to residences.

Donnie Pell, owner of Southern Towers, Applicant Stated that he was here to answer any questions.

The Board of Commissioners asked a few questions regarding additional risks to those already sick, if any regulating entity was looked at adding more regulations regarding cell towers, and if there had ever been any adverse effects of property values related to a cell tower. The response and information provided showed the regulations in place are to protect all people to keep them safe from any known harmful effects from electromagnetic radiation, this includes children and highly populated, urban areas where cell towers may only be 500 ft away from each other. These regulations have been studied and supported by other entities such as the FCC, FDA, WHO, EPA, and OSHA to name a few.

Chair Dasher closed the public hearing, and the item was referred to the Planning Board.

This Agenda Item was referred to the Planning Board.

BOARD PRIORITIES

24-5404

Receive a presentation on the Draft Unified Development Ordinance Module 3: Administration & Procedures Public Review Drafts and offer feedback about the proposed drafts

<u>Attachments:</u> Module 3 Review of Administration & Procedures Presentation

Unified Development Ordinance Consultants with White and Smith LLC reviewed and discussed the following items with the Board of Commissioners: Recode Chatham

Progress, UDO Scope of Work and Anticipated Schedule, Review of Administration and Procedures Module, and Next Steps.

The Board of Commissioners had a lengthy discussion with the consultants and gave them guidance.

This Agenda Item was referred to the Planning Department.

24-5388 Receive and Discuss Legislative Goals Survey Results

<u>Attachments:</u> 2024 Legislative Goals Survey Results

Intergovernmental Relations Manager Lindsay Ray stated that the North Carolina Association of County Commissioners asks all one hundred counties to submit legislative goals ahead of the 2025-2026 Biennium. Goals must be submitted by August 23rd to be considered by the Legislative Goals Committee in November. The North Carolina Association of County Commissioners' legislative goals process is an opportunity to learn about common challenges facing North Carolina counties and prioritize advocacy efforts with the NC General Assembly. Many of the goals submitted may address a variety of Plan Chatham goals.

Ray stated after discussion with the Board of Commissioners, Staff will work to identify specific Plan Chatham goals for each legislative goal.

Ray reviewed each of the goals presented by the individual commissioners and the Board of Commissioners discussed the goals.

The Board of Commissioners asked Ray to bring back a concise list of goals, to recommend that all one hundred counties would have interest in, to the August 19th meeting.

This Agenda Item was referred to the County Manager's Office.

24-5417 Receive a presentation on Digital Inclusion Plan, broadband grants, and digital Inclusion grants

<u>Attachments:</u> <u>Digital Inclusion Plan Presentation</u>

Policy and Legislative Analyst Brenton Hart presented an update on the Digital Inclusion Plan and Grant Review.

Hart gave a broadband grant overview including maps of the unserved and underserved locations, locations served by fiber and cable.

Hart shared updates on the different grant programs including The Rural Digital Opportunity Fund, e Growing Rural Economies with Access to Technology (GREAT) Grant, and the Completing Access to Broadband (CAB) Program.

Hart shared an update on the Digital Inclusion Grant with Central Pines Regional Council which was received from North Carolina Department of Information Technology. The \$800,000 grant is to establish regional digital literacy efforts in Chatham and Durham Counties. The Grant will establish classes that will provide digital literacy training and a free laptop (post-training) for around 500 Chatham County residents and 500 Durham County residents, and allocate computer carts and laptops to use for digital literacy training in Wren Memorial and Goldston Public Libraries and

Siler City and Pittsboro Centers for Active Living.

Hart described the Digital Inclusion Plan and the steps taken to this point. Hart shared the availability, access, and adoption goals and strategies.

Hart stated once adopted, the plan will be reviewed by Chatham County annually for updating based on the following metrics:

Availability:

- 1. The number of preexisting homes provided internet that year.
- 2. Progress on Grant oriented project development within the year.
- 3. Gross growth of networks within Chatham County.
- 4. Annual surveys regarding student/resident internet availability.
- 1. Change in the number of devices provided across the county.
- 2. Usership of provided programs, and determination of communities most utilizing provided services.
- 3. Change in surveys indicating students access to devices.

Adoption:

- 1. Data on utilization of basic computing classes.
- 2. Establishment and performance of programs that assist with adoption of broadband technologies.

Hart stated that the next step is to receive community input on the plan.

The Board of Commissioners thanked Hart for the update.

This Agenda Item was received and filed.

CLERK'S REPORT

Clerk to the Board Jenifer Johnson stated that there were no agenda items on the first meeting in August and asked to cancel. The consensus of the Board of Commissioners agreed.

Johnson reminded the Board of Commissioners that the North Carolina County Commissioners Conference is in Winston Salem on August the 8 through the 10 and If the board members have any questions about reservations to let her know.

Johnson asked the Board of Commissioners which member of the Board of Commissioners would be the delegate voting member while in Winston Salem. Commissioner Howard said she would be honored to be the delegate.

Johnson stated that the speakers in the courtroom will be upgraded this week, and a new encoder has been ordered which will make the video at home better.

Johnson stated that the board members will be receiving a email from the audit firm Martin Starnes with five questions.

MANAGER'S REPORT

County Manager Dan LaMontagne stated that he had one announcement he would like to make. He has spoken to each commissioner individually, and he read aloud the following statement:

I have worked with Chatham County Government for the past 14 years and have served in either state or local government for over 24 years as of September. This year I will be eligible for full retirement under the local government employee retirement system. It is with mixed emotions that I inform you of my intention to retire on December 27, 2024. I wanted to give you ample notice, so that you can select the next manager before I leave to ensure a smooth transition for our staff. I am thankful for all my friendships along the way, and the hard work and dedication of my coworkers and staff in Chatham County along with all other units of government I have worked with. I am very grateful for the elected Board members that I have had the pleasure of serving over the with over the years and the many opportunities provided to me in my time with the county. Chatham County Government is truly a special place to work with many, many talented staff. I hope that my tenure here is remembered for the team that I have built and the collaborative relationships that I have fostered with towns and counties. I also hope that my time is marked by the amazing economic development projects that I was fortunate enough to help bring to the county and the extension of broadband to more than 45,000 homes and businesses in Chatham County, as you just heard. I leave the county, knowing that we are poised for incredible opportunities with a professional staff that are extremely capable of adapting as the Chatham community grows into a thriving economic and residential destination in the region. Thank you all for my time here. I want to thank all Staff for all their help. We have a great team here. This has been an amazing part of my life. I am absolutely thrilled to retire. I am still going to work, unfortunately for a little few more years. But I am looking forward to doing something different and best of luck to everyone, and we will still work together for another few months.

The Board of Commissioners thanked LaMontagne for his incredible service to Chatham County.

COMMISSIONERS' REPORTS

Commissioner Kenlan thanked Commissioners Howard, Dasher, and Gomez-Flores for the hard work they continue to do. Commissioner Kenlan thanked Commissioner Howard for all the work she does on the reentry Council and added what a wonderful resource she is. Commissioner Kenlan thanked Commissioner Dasher for serving on the Executive Board of the Central Pines Regional Council and thanked Commissioner Gomez-Flores his work on the Board of Health including chairing the meeting recently. Commissioner Kenlan stated that is proud to work with good leadership.

Commissioner Howard thanked County Manager Dan LaMontagne for his service to the county. Commissioner Howard said she heard really good things after the Health Department meeting where Commissioner Gomez-Flores chaired. Commissioner Howard thanked Commissioner Kenlan for taking on the big role with Capital Area Metropolitan Planning Organization. Commissioner Howard thanked Commissioner Dasher for leading the conversation on the Unified Development Ordinance. Commissioner Howard stated that the first meeting was held with the Reentry Council last month and she is looking forward to what we can do to ensure that as people come out of the whatever justice involved situations they may have had. Commissioner Howard thanked Clerk to the Board Jenifer Johnson and Intergovernmental Relations Manager Lindsay Ray.

Commissioner Delaney stated that he attended the Board of Elections, Climate Change Advisory Committee, and Planning Board meetings. Commissioner Delaney shared some of the ideas from the Climate Change group. Commissioner Delaney stated that he attended the National Association of Counties conference, and he will pass along some materials.

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Vice Chair Karen Howard, seconded by Commissioner Katie Kenlan, that this was adjourned. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chair Dasher, Vice Chair Howard, Commissioner Delaney, Commissioner Gomez Flores, and Commissioner Kenlan